BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 10631818 1

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW

COURSE MATERIALS

VOLUME III

Carol Rogerson

Katherine E. Swinton

1986-7

Toronto

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

1986

Prepared with the assistance of Kathleen Baker.

LAW LIBRARY
JAN 20 1987
LTY OF LAW
Y OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW

COURSE MATERIALS

VOLUME III

Carol Rogerson

Katherine E. Swinton

1986-7

Toronto

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

1986

Prepared with the assistance of Kathleen Baker.

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2019 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/constitutionalla03roge_2

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Page
IV CIVIL LIBERTIES		
1. Division of Powers		
Reference re Alberta Statutes		571
A.-G. Canada v. Dupond	(Vol.II)	484
2. The Canadian Bill of Rights		
R. v. Drybones		578
Miller and Cockreill v. The Queen		580
Note: Continued Relevance of the Bill of Rights		582
R. v. Therens		582
Reference Materials		584
3. The Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms		
(a) Principles of Interpretation		
Ely, Democracy and Distrust		584
Brest, "The Fundamental Rights Controversy"		598
Reference Materials		599
(b) Section 1		
(i) Reasonable Limits		
Hunter v. Southam Inc.		600
R. v. Oakes		602
A.-G. Quebec v. Quebec Association of Protestant School Boards		605
(ii) Prescribed by Law		
Re Ontario Film and Video Appreciation Society and Ontario Board of Censors		
- Divisional Court		613
- Court of Appeal		620
Note re. Sunday Times v. United Kingdom		621
R. v. Therens		622
Note		623
Reference Materials		623

(c) **Application**

(i) **American State Action Doctrine**

Gunther, "State Action" 624
Burton v. Wilmington Parking Authority 627
Shelley v. Kraemer 630

(ii) **What is the Meaning of "Government" Under the Charter?**

Note 633

(iii) **Does the Charter Apply to Private Activity?**

R. v. Lerke 634
Re Blainey and Ontario Hockey Association 638
Note 641

Reference Materials 641

(d) **Standing**

Note 642
National Citizens Coalition v. A.-G. Canada (excerpt) 642
R. v. Big M Drug Mart (excerpt) 643

(e) **Corporations and the Charter: Can Corporations Claim the Protection of the Charter?**

Note 647

Reference Materials 648

(f) **Remedies**

Manitoba Language Rights Reference 649
Germain v. The Queen 657
Crossman v. The Queen 662
Note re Vespoli v. The Queen 666
Swann v. Charlotte-Mecklenburg Board of Education 666
Note 669

Reference Materials 669

3. **Section 7**

(a) **The Guarantees** 670

(b) **Political Question and Justiciability**

Operation Dismantle Inc. v. The Queen 672

(c) Fundamental Justice

Reference re Section 94(2) of the Motor Vehicle Act 679
Re Mia and Medical Services Commission, B.C. 696

Reference Materials 701

4. Freedom of Expression

(a) General Principles

The Guarantees 702
Free Expression: The Purposes of the Guarantee 704

Reference Materials 706

(b) American Approaches

Note 707

(c) Components of the Right

(i) What is Expression?

Re Koumoudouros 709
Re Klein and Law Society of Upper Canada 712

Reference Materials 722

(ii) Right to Receive Information: Access to Courts

Re Ontario Film and Video Appreciation Society and Ontario Board of Censors 613
Re Southam Inc. and the Queen (No. 1) 723

(iii) Public Forum

Committee for the Commonwealth of Canada v. The Queen 734

(iv) Access to the Media and Equalizing Opportunities for Expression

Reference re Alberta Statutes 571
First National Bank of Boston v. Bellotti 738
National Citizens Coalition Inc. v. A.-G. Canada 742
Re MacKay and Government of Manitoba 750

Reference Materials 755

(d) **Hate Literature**

(i) **American Approaches**

Collin v. Smith 756

(ii) **Canadian Approaches**

The Criminal Code s. 281.1 773
Radio Broadcasting Regs., s. 5 774
Canadian Human Rights Act, s. 13 774
Saskatchewan Human Rights Code, s. 14 775
International Convetion, Article 4 775
The Queen v. Keegstra 776
Note re. Canadian Human Rights Commission and Taylor 791

Reference Materials 791

(e) **Pornorgraphy**

(i) **American Approaches**

Schad v. Mt. Ephraim 792
New York v. Ferber 801

(ii) **Canadian Approaches**

Ontario Film and Video Appreciation Society and Ontario Board of Censors 613
Ontario Theatres Act and Regs. 804
Criminal Code, s. 159 807
Sask. Human Rights Code, s. 14 775
R. v. Red Hot Video Ltd. 808
Re Red Hot Video and City of Vancouver 818
Malamuth, "Aggressive Pornorgraphy and Aggression Against Women" 822
McCormack, "Censorship May Not Be The Answer to Porn" 823

Reference Materials 824

5. **Freedom of Religion and Conscience**

(a) **The Guarantees** 825

(b) **American Appraoches**

Gunther, "The Constitution and Religion" 826
Sherbert v. Verber 828
Wisconsin v. Yoder 832
Note re. Goldman v. Caspar Weinberger, Secretary of Defense 839

(c) **The Charter**

R. v. Big M Drug Mart Ltd. 840
R. v. Videoflicks 863
Note re. Ontario Human Rights Commission and Simpsons Sears Ltd. 873

6. **Mobility Rights**

(a) **Rights of Citizenship (Pre-Charter)**

Winner v. S.M.T. (Eastern) Ltd. and A.-G. of Canada 874
Morgan v. A.-G. for P.E.I. 878

(b) **Charter of Rights**

Laskin, "The Canadian Constitutional Proposals" 887
Law Society of Upper Canada v. Skapinker 888
Black v. Law Society of Alberta 899
Allman v. Commissioner of N.W.T. 912
Basile v. A.-G. of N.S. 919

7. **Equality**

(a) **The Guarantees** 924

(b) **Equality as a Moral and Political Concept**

(i) **Equality as Sameness**

Weston, "The Empty Idea of Equality" 926

(ii) **Equality of Respect, Equality of Consideration**

Dworkin, "Taking Rights Seriously" 928

(iii) **Classical Liberalism: Equality as Liberty**

Gutman, "Liberal Equality" 930

(iv) **Equality of Opportunity**

Abella, "Equality in Employment" 932

(v) **Inequality as Subordination**

MacKinnon, Sexual Harassment of Working Women (excerpts) 937

Review: Re Sask. Human Rights Commission and Canadian Odeon Theatres Ltd. 942

(c) Equality as a Legal Concept

(i) Formal Equality

Note and A.-G. Canada v. Lavell 948

(ii) Substantive Equality: American Equal Protection Doctrine

Gunther, "Equal Protection: An Introductory Overview" 950
Tussman and tenBroek, "The Equal Protection of the Laws" 957
Tribe, American Constitutional Law (excerpt) 963
City of Cleburne v. Cleburne Hiring Center 966

(iii) Equality and the Canadian Bill of Rights: The "Valid Federal Objective" Test

MacKay v. The Queen 973

(d) The Charter: Section 15

Swinton, "Restraints on Government Efforts to Promote Equality in Employment" 988
Re Andrews and Law Society of B.C. 993
Smith, Kline & French Laboratories v. A.-G. Canada 1004

(e) Disparate Impact and Systemic Discrimination

Note 1010
Personnel Administrator of Mass. v. Feeney 1011
Minister of Justice (Can.), Equality Issues in Federal Law 1022
A.-G. (Ont.), Sources for the Interpretation of Equality Rights Under the Charter 1022

(f) Affirmative Action

Abella, Equality in Employment 1029
Swinton, "Restraints on Government..." 1030
Tribe, "Affirmative Action: The Bakke Decision" 1034
Re Athabasca Tribal Council and Amoco Canada Petroleum Co. Ltd. 1040
Shewchuck v. Ricard 1048

(g) Age Discrimination

(i) Age Generally

Re City of Montreal and Arcade Amusements 1058

(ii) The Lower End of the Spectrum

Re McDonald and The Queen 1059
Note re.Federalism and the Charter 1066

(iii) The Upper End of the Spectrum

Ont. Human Rights Commission v. Borough of Etobicoke 1067
Boyer Report (excerpts) 1073
Perry, "The Principle of Equal Protection" 1077

(h) Sexual Equality

(i) The Guarantees 1081

(ii) The Relationhsip Between s. 15 and s. 28

Hosek, "Women and the Constitutional Process" (excerpts) 1082
Re Blainey and Ontario Hockey Assoc. 1089

(iii) Sexuality

Michael M. v. Superior Ct. of Sonoma County 1096
R. v. D.I.L. 1105

(iv) Pregnancy

Bliss v. A.-G. Canada 1109
California Federal Savings and Loan Assoc. v. Guerra 1114

(v) Education and Sports

Mississipi University for Women v. Hogan 1118
Re Blainey and Ontario Hockey Assoc. 1089